

Borough of Carlisle
Workshop Meeting Minutes
February 3, 2021

This meeting was held via Zoom due to the restrictions of social distancing put in place do to Covid-19.

Present at the meeting: Councilors Crampsie, Fulham-Winston, Hicks, Landis, Deputy Mayor Shultz, Mayor Scott and Stuby. Also present were: Borough Manager Armstrong, Assistant Borough Manager Snyder, Water Resources Director Malarich, Community Development Manager Skelly, Parks & Recreation Director Crouse, Police Chief Landis, Fire Chief Snyder, Public Information Coordinator Taylor, Dickinson Law Student Ambassador Speer, Dickinson College Student Ambassador DelMain and Borough Secretary Stone.

I. Call to Order & Pledge of Allegiance

Mayor Scott called the Workshop Meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

II. Public Hearing: 7-11 Liquor License

Borough Council held a public hearing for purposes of hearing a request by 7-Eleven Sales Corporation, Inc. regarding transfer of restaurant liquor license number R-14079 from Lemoyne, Pennsylvania to Carlisle Borough, Cumberland County.

Attorney Edward Taraskus represented 7- Eleven for the potential liquor license transfer to be located at 1003 South Hanover Street in Carlisle. He provided a statement from Pamela Paciolla, 7-Eleven's real estate representative which included an overview of the proposed store layout, hours of operation and the amenities that would be offered.

Councilor Landis inquired the basis of how they determined the hours of operation for late hours. Ms. Paciolla replied that the proposed hours were based on a similar retailers hours.

Ms. TaWanda Stallworth, Lower Swatara Township, asked for the company's position on hiring employees from diverse backgrounds and what is their commitment to diversity with regard to hiring practices. Ms. Paciolla remarked that they have training to ensure they are diverse across the entire organization, as well as being cognizant to represent all cultures. Ms. Stallworth asked Council to have quantified data before making a decision.

Mr. Chris Wyman, 349 West Ridge Street, Carlisle, Pennsylvania, inquired as to if there was an impact studies on the effects on property values with the establishment of a 7-Eleven in Carlisle. Ms. Paciolla responded that 7-Eleven does not typically preform impact studies but she will inquire about a study.

Councilor Fulham-Winston and Landis requested that Ms. Paciolla send 7-Eleven's diversity, inclusion and hiring corporate policy to the Borough Manager.

The public hearing was adjourned at 6:24 p.m.

III. Citizens to be Heard

Espoir DelMain proposed that the Borough enact an apology similar to the one that was passed earlier last year acknowledging the violence that happened at the Carlisle Indian School. She recommended the presence of the Borough on stolen indigenous territory through the enacting of the land acknowledgment before the moment of silence at every Borough Council meeting. Ms. DelMain considers it important that the Borough as the local government entity, institutionalize this practice to

recognize, remind and honor the history that the Borough lies on. As well as, the violent and traumatic impacts on generations of indigenous people that took place in our Borough and have global impacts to this day.

Mr. Laszlo Pasztor, 532 South Hanover Street, Carlisle, Pennsylvania remarked in order to be historically objective and accurate, the moment of silence should also include those settlers on the frontier that were slaughtered by the indigenous people.

Ms. Victoria Hamel, 715 Sherwood Drive, Carlisle, Pennsylvania, noted the public acknowledgment should also include that the indigenous people lost not only their lives, but also their culture.

IV. Meeting Minutes

A. Borough Council voted 7-0 to approve the January 6, 2021 Workshop Meeting Minutes. (Scott/Hicks)

V. Employee Relations and Citizen Participation Committee

A. Truth and Reconciliation Commission Resolution:

Councilor Jeff Stuby provided a statement with background information regarding the Truth and Reconciliation Commission. The statement is attached to these minutes.

Mr. Brad Wenger, owner of Wenger Meats and Ice Company in Carlisle, registered a strong objection to the language in the proposed resolution. He noted he is a white businessman in this town. His family has been in business for approximately 60 years. Their business has practiced as much as possible hiring honestly and equitably across the board to all races and backgrounds of people. They have lived through generations of civil rights, affirmative action. The common practice of most larger corporations like 7-Eleven is clearly for their own benefit of fairness, hiring and opportunity. He stated the implications of most of the statements in this resolution is that the difficulties that attend the residents of color in our community are laid at the feet of white residents. He finds that very objectionable and suggested the need to rethink the implications of this resolution.

Mr. Laszlo Pasztor, 6532 South Hanover Street, Carlisle, Pennsylvania, stated he read the resolution and noted it is one thing to make a statement versus proving it. To just state that there is racial injustice and systemic racism as objective realities does not make the case. He noted some on Council are attorneys and know about elements of proof. He stated he hasn't heard any proof, there have been anecdotes but he's not convinced. Mr. Pasztor noted he sees virtue signaling and he doesn't think Borough Council is the place for it. He agreed that there is a presupposition of the critical race theory here, all whites are racists, all blacks are victims. Mr. Pasztor said he found it interesting if that were the case, then how do we have a black mayor and a black chief of police? He asked how do you reconcile that. He noted he would be more inclined to listen to our Mayor and our police chief speaking to members of the black community and telling them how to lift themselves up by their bootstraps as they did. Mr. Pasztor stated they are an example and his hope would be that they would mentor others. He questioned the particulars of what this resolution proposes to do. He first mentioned collecting evidence and asked what kind of evidence and to what end. He asked what Council would be doing with any evidence. Mr. Pasztor inquired if we are talking about prosecutions or are we talking about giving people a chance to vent. He then questioned certain phrases in the resolution and noted it is just virtue signaling.

Councilor Fulham-Winston questioned Mr. Pasztor on the meaning of virtue signaling. Mr. Pasztor explained that virtue signaling is taking positions just to show how morally virtuous we are, a gesture. They don't produce any productive constructive action, they are done so that we look like we're

morally virtuous. He noted he views the resolution as a gesture. Mr. Pasztor asked to what end are we going to facilitate more of these collaborating conversations with existing businesses, non-profits agencies, boards and commissions. He stated this resolution is nebulous and has no particulars. He questioned what policies, what institutional reforms that are mentioned in the resolution when there have been no particulars. Mr. Pasztor strongly recommend that Council reconsider the resolution because he sees it as reverse racism. He noted there is a presupposition that all whites are racists. He stated it has not been proven that there is systematic racism in this community, that there is racial injustice and there are inequities. Mr. Pasztor acknowledged that nobody has proven that they are due to racism. They have proven to be different outcomes within our borough of seventy nine percent white, nine percent black, seven percent Hispanic, two percent Asians, forty eight percent of the blacks make up forty percent those living under poverty level.

Councilor Landis explained that a resolution does not always have an outcome, it is a work in progress and a guiding document. A resolution may eventually help make changes, but Council needs to be informed to do so.

Mr. Pasztor stated the resolution is founded on unsupportable racist generalizations. The resolution is pointless, it is untrue, and it violates the sensibilities of decent whites.

Ms. Victoria Hamel, noted she is in support of the resolution as written and explained the shared stories are to bring awareness. The wording is not to make a person feel fragile or upset. It is to make one be aware and think of what they can do to change internal biases and internal prejudices. She noted if you become offended, then self-reflect on yourself and see where you might be finding some form of objection to the resolution, when nothing in the resolution was meant to be offend offensive. She stated there is statistical proof that in Carlisle, which was quoted at the town hall meeting, when you break down the percentage of people of color in Carlisle, that percentage shows them not having the same equal opportunities as that of whites and other non-people of color.

Ms. Marcia Berry, who works within the Carlisle community, stated she is in favor of the resolution. She suggested there is confusion of the meaning between individual prejudice and racism. She remarked the resolution is not about blame, it is not about saying whites are this or blacks are that and nowhere does it say that all white are being racist. She noted that people need to make a distinction between systemic racism, so when we talk about systemic racism we talk about the institutional embedded structures that may have inadvertently privileged some and disadvantaged others. Ms. Berry thanked the person for the definition of virtue signaling, as she was not familiar with that term. She provided an example of a major corporation such as Quaker Oats taking Uncle Ben's off their packaging being a gesture or virtue signaling. Ms. Berry pointed out a community undertaking a truth and reconciliation commission has a meaningful outcome. She expressed that the end is healing, the end is truth-telling, the end is creating a community where everyone feels heard, everyone feels welcome and everyone has equal opportunities. She suggested that if we want to look at statistics, they can be viewed on the town hall meeting PowerPoint on the Borough website. Ms. Berry remarked that the town hall meeting was where all the disparities were fully explained and that the Borough has done its homework. She urged people to undertake their own study of the actual definitions of racism to understand the difference between individual prejudice and what is systemic. Ms. Berry noted it does not mean that anyone is a bad person because we wish to dismantle some of the historic interwoven in our fabric disparities that exist because of race.

Mr. Jay Lehman, 226 Parker Street, Carlisle, Pennsylvania expressed that it is really important that we understand that this is not a blame game. He noted the resolution is a continuum of an education effort that began with recent town hall meeting. Mr. Lehman stated it was an amazing discussion and he appreciated the sharing that occurred. He remarked that is was clear that the validity of this approach to take a truth and reconciliation commission is more than needed. This is not about sidebar conversations or family discussions or neighborhood cliques where you get together and talk

about what is or isn't right about Carlisle. Mr. Lehman explained we need a public forum that will take these issues into a broader viewpoint and allow them to be tested factually and historically. He noted, for him as a lawyer by training and as a scientist in college, people can have different opinions but we need to be working off the same fact base. Mr. Lehman expressed that he has great confidence that this process will enable that to happen. He stated he is white and there are privileges, the result of which is humbling. He noted when you study it, you become more and more aware of how that has worked in your life and he understand the frustration that people of color have. To that end, he is working in other community settings and in his church to support these issues and bring forward a more welcoming environment to our community.

Ms. Cheryl Parsons, 351 Belvedere Street, Carlisle, Pennsylvania, noted she is a retired educator from the Carlisle Area School District and she feels this is a long overdue commission. She remarked that this is an admirable thing for the Borough to undertake. Ms. Parsons made the following statements: "We are a separate geographical community and we do not get to hear each other's stories very often. We tend to label each other with stereotypes. We need to talk to each other in order to better understand the situation that is very difficult for our people of color to pull themselves up by their bootstraps." This is because it is not an equal playing field and she doesn't think most white people understand that unless they take the time to really study what systemic racism is. She taught for 35 years and it is only since she has been retired and studying systemic racism that she fully comprehended what some of her black students were up against as they were trying to pull themselves up by their bootstraps. Ms. Parsons strongly encouraged the Borough to follow through with this resolution.

Espoir DelMain noted that she agreed with Ms. Berry and Mr. Layman about the importance of this truth and reconciliation commission and the work, especially of white people, to be anti-racist. She remarked that she does not think it is fair for the call that was made of Mayor Scott and Chief Landis. She does not think it is fair for that demand to be made because people of color obviously bear the brunt and burden of these issues and it is unfair to continue to perpetuate that. She noted the truth and reconciliation commission in her mind is an excellent opportunity to create healing. As Ms. Berry said, acknowledging the painful history and committing ourselves to being better without continuing to put that labor on the people that experience the most harm and violence from the systems.

Ms. TaWanda Stallworth noted she is glad to be a part of this community and glad of all that it represents. She remarked that it is both good and bad. It is successful persons of color which extend beyond the Mayor and the Police Chief, as well as many others who have done due diligence in this town and who are of darker hue. She thanked everyone for taking on this resolution and taking ourselves to task for the creation of this legislation. Ms. Stallworth expressed her thanks for what this has cost them to do. She remarked the comments that she heard earlier this evening further substantiate the need for such a resolution. "If we weren't clear that there was a problem with race in this country, in this borough, certainly we have a better idea of that tonight." She stated the Reverend Dr. Martin Luther King Jr. said publicly that a man cannot pull himself up by his bootstraps if he has no boots. Ms. Stallworth noted the she is grateful for the steps that this resolution can take to ensure that all of our brothers and sisters one day get some boots. She noted that it has also been said that the general generalizations put forth in the Resolution are often vague and she thinks that part of the reason for that is to allow room for everyone to be able to pick up a piece of their own education and be able to grow in their vantage point. She closed by saying anytime we're doing this work, anytime we're talking about race, anytime we're talking about racism anti-racism and doing the work, if you're not causing a stir, if you're not creating some good trouble, then you haven't done it enough.

Mayor Scott remarked in order to heal, you must first remember and to him that's what this truth and reconciliation commission represents. It is an opportunity for this community that he calls home to learn about the past and to find out exactly what those root issues are that we need to address as

far as racial equity is concerned. He noted we will be addressing multiple things with this commission. He thanked those who were on the town hall planning committee for their leadership in getting us to this point.

Councilor Hicks remarked that without ascribing causes, causality, and blame, there is no doubt that in virtually every area of our public sphere there is inequities. Whether it is access to financing, whether it is access to communities and redlining, virtually everywhere you look there is inequity. There are probably going to be many reasons for those and many of them not based on conscious decisions. He expressed it is compelling, overwhelming, and indisputable, and he is interested in learning how we can do better. He stated that he thinks this resolution reflects how we can get results without ascribing blame and that is why he is looking forward to supporting this.

Councilor Landis remarked that she grew up in a town that did not have a large African-American population and that she is proud and honored to live in a community that has this historic diversity. She noted that it also comes with the reality that we did not do things right all the time and that we can acknowledge it and we can painfully work through it and that's exactly what this is about. Councilor Landis expressed that she has tried to educate herself as well but, it is okay to just work through it. The only way that we as a country can move forward is for one town at a time to take this on. Maybe Carlisle can be a town that other people and other towns can look to as the road map if we do this right. She stated we have to push forward and not shy away from this hard work and to sit and to listen to the stories and to understand what really has happened. Councilor Landis remarked that we can do as much research and understanding on our own but there are many things that we don't know about. She noted that she appreciates the work that is gone into this in a very short period of time and she looks forward to learning more as this resolution is passed and taken forward.

Councilor Fulham-Winston brought attention to the language in the resolution that states one of the efforts would be to identify, analyze, and make recommendations to Carlisle Borough Council. She remarked that institutional and policy reforms are meant to mend the wounds of racial injustice and combat systemic racism. We need people to come to us and tell us their truths so that we can recognize them and take steps that will make Carlisle a more equitable and safe community for all. But they can't do that until they learn better about what the impacts of our past actions and present actions have been on the entire community. She noted that she is looking forward to those folks coming forward and sharing so they can be educated and have a better understanding of what the Borough can do to make this a better community for everyone who is living here.

Deputy Mayor Shultz remarked persons run for elected office not to lay blame on people. He stated for those who feel like the resolution or what may come of this is an attempt to lay blame, that's not at all the intent. The intent is to find solutions. Deputy Mayor Shultz noted being a lawyer; this is what lawyers do, reach out to people who have born witness to the events. In this case, the racism that may have taken place. Witness lawyers gather the evidence and that's what the resolution, on its face, intended to do in part. We have discussions with those who are involved and then we make our case. He explained that the town hall meeting was the first step and in that town hall, he put together the data, which just scratched the surface. Deputy Mayor Shultz recognized there was a lot more he wasn't going to have time to go into. He encouraged all of those who haven't watched watch the town hall video to take a look at that first step in gathering the evidence. He spoke of interviews from the 80s of a republican strategist who was talking about the southern strategy they employed back then. They talked about moving from the early overt racism of using the n-word and very overtly racist practices, to then later in the 60s opposing busing. By the time the 80s rolled around, realizing they could no longer win on this, they talked about using more abstract devices in economic policy and other laws. "So when we talk about systemic racism I'm not blaming those who may be attending tonight. There are certainly structures in place that lead us to the figures that we see here in in the borough and across the nation." Deputy Mayor Shultz stated that it is not that

they are attempting to lay blame on anybody. He expressed the he is a white guy and that he prepared for this conversation, He is not afraid of it and we're going to use it to make it a better place for every single member of the community.

Councilor Crampsie remarked that this isn't the first step, it is part of a number of steps that he hopes to see moving forward. He stated that he is sure this isn't easy for some to hear, the thought of racism existing, but it is real and he thinks as elected officials, they are doing a disservice if they put their heads in the sand and say that this is not an issue. He stated over a hundred people were on that call a few weeks ago. "We had a great panel and we need to listen to those folks. They are not making things up, they're not virtue signaling or whatever it may be. Those are real stories from our very real residents." He thinks that, as elected officials, they owe it to them to get this ball rolling and to really look, sit, and listen. He expressed that he knows it is not his job to lecture people, but he is going to listen and that he heard those residents last week loud and clear. He thinks that this is definitely something we need to move forward with. He recommended that Council add this as an item to the March Borough Council meeting to consider and vote on.

VI. Mayor's Report

A. Recovery Strategies Ratification:

Borough Council voted 7-0 to ratify the following COVID-19 economic recovery measures designed to assist the Borough of Carlisle's small business community and respond to the public health emergency. (Scott/Shultz)

1. Special Event application for Nothing Sweeter, 10 West Pomfret Street, Carlisle that was held on Saturday, January 23, 2021 to commemorate the bakery's one year anniversary. Request included securing on-street parking space(s) for event. Approval was subject to applicant providing a valid Certificate of Liability Insurance form naming the Borough of Carlisle as an additional insured; applicant assuming responsibility for compliance of any/all relevant precautionary measures at time of event including mobile food vendor; and, requirement that any/all trash and food waste from site at conclusion of the event.

B. Community Engagement Platform:

Assistant Borough Manager Owen Snyder introduced a program initiated by the National League of Cities (NLC) that will help increase the Borough's engagement with the community. The NLC has partnered with CivStart to find entrepreneurs or startups and match them with organizations and their needs. The Borough has actively been working with Citizenlab to implement an online platform that will improve the Borough's community engagement. Public Information Coordinator Taylor explained the new platform will provide more an authentic two-way form of communication between resident and the municipality than just social media. A few options in the new platform will be surveys, participatory budgeting module and mapping features. She noted a go live date could be as soon as the beginning for March. Ms. Taylor also communicated that translation services are now available on the Borough's website and she will be working on making translations of documents available.

Councilor Fulham-Winston suggested inquiring with Dickinson College to see if there is any interest in a student internship for the purpose of assisting with additional document translations for the website.

VII. Economic Development Committee

A. Liquor License Transfer Request

Borough Council voted 7-0 to approve a request by 7-Eleven Sales Corporation to permit the inter-municipal transfer of a Restaurant Liquor License from Lemoyne Borough to the Borough of Carlisle. The proposed location of the licensee is 1003 South Hanover Street, Carlisle, Pennsylvania. (Hicks/Fulham-Winston)

VIII. Community Planning & Smart Growth Committee

A. Subdivision & Land Development Ordinance Amendment (SALDO):

Community Development Manager Skelly explained the amendments in the ordinance are to improve the application process of submissions to the Planning Commission as well as improve public outreach on upcoming projects. Discussion ensued with Councilors and Mr. Skelly regarding not requiring a public meeting for a minor development or subdivision. Mr. Skelly noted he will make changes to the ordinance amendment to clarify the requirement for public meetings.

Mr. Chris Wyman noted, as a member of the Tri-County Workforce Housing Commission, there have been initiatives proposed at the state and county level for workforce housing development. He inquired if this ordinance amendment will have an impact on this initiative. Mr. Skelly responded that the ordinance amendment was primarily to provide additional time for the Planning Commission to review submitted plans. He noted the SALDO amendments were to address immediate council concerns and not to address workforce housing. He added that a possible zoning ordinance could be a better tool to address such areas.

Ms. Cecile Strand, 348 Wilson Street, Carlisle, Pennsylvania, questioned if the Long-Garrity subdivision would have been considered a minor land development. Mr. Skelly remarked that the Long-Garrity subdivision would not have fallen under that term and would have required public outreach.

IX. Public Works Committee

A. Service Agreement at Water Treatment Plant

Borough Council voted 7-0 to approve renewal of the annual service contract with HACH Service Partnership for preventative maintenance and servicing of equipment at the Carlisle Water Treatment Facility. Contract is for a one-year period effective February 4, 2021. (Fulham-Winston/Landis)

B. Water Meter Remote Communication Capacity Purchase through COSTARS

Borough Council voted 7-0 to approve the purchase of Sensus FlexNet meter transmitters from LB Water for a not-to-exceed cost of \$950,000.00 (nine hundred fifty thousand dollars) through the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania's cooperative purchasing program (COSTARS) program to equip all remaining water meters in the Borough's system with remote, smart meter capabilities. (Fulham-Winston/Landis)

C. Remote Monitoring Camera Purchase and Installation through COSTARS

Borough Council voted 7-0 to approve the purchase and installation of monitoring cameras at the Borough's water storage facilities by Cam-Tek Systems, Inc. for \$29,921.00 (Twenty-nine thousand nine hundred twenty-one dollars) through the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania's cooperative purchasing program (COSTARS) program. (Fulham-Winston/Landis)

D. Purchase of Utility Dump Truck through COSTARS

Borough Council voted 7-0 to approve the purchase of a 10-ton International Dump Truck from Five Star of Harrisburg, PA and an accompanying stainless steel heated dump body from US Municipal of King of Prussia, PA for \$146,375.00 (One hundred forty-six thousand three hundred seventy-five dollars) through the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania's cooperative purchasing program (COSTARS) program. (Fulham-Winston/Landis)

X. New Business

No citizen were heard

XI. Adjournment

There being no further business or public comment, the meeting adjourned at 7:44 p.m.

Timothy A. Scott
Mayor

Joyce E. Stone, Borough Secretary

Statement by Councilor Jeff Stuby

Thank you, Mr. Mayor. I have one discussion item this evening. Before we get into that discussion though, I'd like to provide a little background.

Racial inequity and systemic racism are objective realities in Carlisle. Statistics from the Census Bureau bear that out, as Deputy Mayor Shultz highlighted at the recent town hall held two and a half weeks ago.

Over one hundred people attended that event, and one of the recommendations those attendees made was forming a truth and reconciliation commission. We, as a community, need to look comprehensively at our past and bear witness to the truth of racial injustice. That was a clear message coming out of the recent town hall.

To that end, I worked with panelists from the town hall to draft a resolution establishing the Carlisle Truth and Reconciliation Commission. I want to clarify that this resolution is on tonight's agenda for us to discuss, not to vote on. Based on our discussion, we could decide to vote on this resolution at a future meeting.

Before I turn things over for public comment, I want to thank everyone who shared their questions and thoughts on this resolution so far. Any action we take on this needs to be a group effort. And it's my hope that we can have an open and honest discussion about this proposal.

I'll note that we, as a council, have received emails thus far both in support and in opposition of this draft resolution. With that, I'll open the floor to attendees from the public for their comments. From there, I'll turn things over to council for discussion.